

**MINUTES OF DAY 2 OF THE 48TH ANNUAL CONVENTION
AND ORGANIZATION MEETING OF THE LIBERTARIAN PARTY OF NEW YORK
HELD ON SUNDAY, SEPTEMBER 27, 2020
ON THE ZOOM MEETING APP AND PORCUPINE APP**

Note: This meeting is a continuation of the meeting that began on September 26, 2020.

The meeting was called to order at 9:01 a.m. by Anthony D’Orazio, Chair of the Interim State Committee. A roll call of voting members was conducted. 45 of 66 Members of the State Committee were present at the time of roll call; Shawn Hannon later entered the meeting.

MEMBERS PRESENT

Michael F. Madrid, Judicial District 1
Ilya Schwartzburg, Judicial District 1
Tucker C. Coburn, Judicial District 2
Matthew I. Morgan, Judicial District 2
Gary S. Popkin, Judicial District 2
William Cody Anderson, Judicial District 3
Jay A. Carr, Judicial District 3
Todd G. Haggerty, Judicial District 3
Lora L. Newell, Judicial District 3
Robert M. Arrigo, Judicial District 4
Frederick A. Cole, Jr., Judicial District 4
Nathan B. Dunn, Judicial District 4
John A. Janes, Judicial District 4
Karyn A. Keniry-Thompson, Judicial District 4
Maria V. Borell, Judicial District 5
Milva E. Dordal, Judicial District 5
Shawn Hannon, Judicial District 5
Sean S. Stevens, Judicial District 5
Mark S. Braiman, Judicial District 6
Timothy M. O’Connor, Judicial District 6
Christopher M. Olenski, Judicial District 6
Richard F. Purtell, Judicial District 6
Thomas D. Quiter, Judicial District 6
Dustin D. Tait, Judicial District 6
Steven G. Becker, Judicial District 7
Kari Bittner, Judicial District 7
Anthony D’Orazio, Judicial District 7
James M. Dayton, Judicial District 7
Mark E. Glogowski, Judicial District 7
Sean C. Phelan, Judicial District 7
Erin M. Becker, Judicial District 8
Francis Law, Judicial District 8
Andrew M. Kolstee, Judicial District 8
Peyton D. Kunselman, Judicial District 8
Duane J. Whitmer, Judicial District 8
Daniel P. Donnelly, Judicial District 9

Pietro S. Geraci, Judicial District 9
Robert J. Greibesland, Judicial District 9
Anthony W. Pellegrino, Judicial District 9
William K. Schmidt, Judicial District 9
Michael A. Arcati, Judicial District 11
Gabrielle S. Cordova, Judicial District 11
Irwin Mark Weinblatt, Judicial District 11
Aaron A. Commey, Judicial District 12
Richard Bell, Judicial District 13
Susan B. Overeem-Cummings, Judicial District 13

MEMBERS ABSENT

Mark N. Axinn, Judicial District 1
Gilbert L. Midonnet, Judicial District 2
Brandon G. Lyon, Judicial District 4
Craig A. Miles, Judicial District 5
Eric A. Cooper, Judicial District 7
Andrew C. Hollister, Judicial District 7
James P. Russell, Judicial District 7
Kevin A. Wilson, Judicial District 7
Kathleen M. Ligammari, Judicial District 8
F. Patrick Mahoney, Jr., Judicial District 8
Nicholas P. Phelps, Jr., Judicial District 8
Tara L. Scrivano, Judicial District 8
Deepak Bansal, Judicial District 10
Gary L. Donoyan, Judicial District 10
Kenneth Epstein, Judicial District 10
Carmen Horan, Judicial District 10
Bobby K. Kalotee, Judicial District 10
Satinder Kaur, Judicial District 10
Mahavir Singh, Judicial District 10
Enmanuel H. Torres, Judicial District 12

OBSERVERS

Caryn Ann Harlos, Parliamentarian
Jeffrey D. Motta, Member, Interim State Committee
Timothy “TJ” Ferreira, Porcupine Administrator
Paul M. Grindle, Member-At-Large, Executive Committee

Motion by Gary Popkin to **suspend the Special Rules of Order (Exhibit 1) to consider filling the vacancies in Judicial District 1 and Judicial District 5** was seconded by Irwin Mark Weinblatt and debated.

Motion by Lora Newell to **postpone definitely the filling of vacancies to the next State Committee meeting** was seconded by Nathan Dunn, debated, and passed 27-17, with 1 abstention.

Motion by Pietro Geraci to **adopt the recommendations of the unofficial Platform Committee** was seconded by Mark Braiman. William Cody Anderson raised a point of order, indicating that no such committee existed in an official capacity.

Motion by Frederick Cole to **defer amendments to the platform to a committee** was seconded by Robert Greibesland, debated, and passed 26-14, with 1 abstention.

Motion by Christopher Olenski to **suspend the Special Rules of Order to resume the Rules Subcommittee report** was seconded by Peyton Kunselman, debated, and passed 35-5, with 2 abstentions.

Motion by Robert Arrigo and seconded by Frederick Cole to adopt the following amendments:

Strike “within the first seven (7) days of petitioning” and insert “thirty (30) days or more prior to the start of the petitioning period” in Article 14.2.2 and Article 14.3.1
Strike “within the first seven (7) days of petitioning, or prior to the meeting” and insert “thirty (30) days or more prior to the start of the petitioning period” in Article 14.4.2.
Insert “containing the political division” after “County Affiliate” in Article 14.4.2.

Robert Arrigo’s motion was debated and failed 20-18, with 3 abstentions.

Motion by Daniel Donnelly to **strike the entirety of Article 10 entitled “Judicial Committee”** failed due to lack of a second.

Motion by Robert Arrigo and seconded by Timothy O’Connor to **strike the entirety of Article 14.5 entitled “PROHIBITION AGAINST ACCOMMODATIONS”** was debated.

Motion by Pietro Geraci to **divide and consider each paragraph in Article 14.5 separately** was seconded by Robert Greibesland and failed 27-10, with 3 abstentions, and without debate.

Robert Arrigo’s main motion to **strike Article 14.5** was debated and passed 16-15, with 5 abstentions.

The meeting stood at ease starting at 10:36 a.m. The business resumed at 11:00 a.m.

Resolutions Subcommittee Chair Mark Glogowski indicated that there is nothing to report.

Frederick Cole called for orders of the day. Anthony D’Orazio addressed the convention and thanked those who served as members of the Interim State Committee.

Motion by Mark Braiman **to reconvene to October 10, 2020 at 9:00 a.m.** was seconded by Sean Phelan. The motion was discarded after a roll call vote of all 10 members of the Executive Committee unanimously **waived notice to hold a meeting of the Executive Committee on Tuesday, September 29, 2020 at 8:00 p.m.**

Motion by Mark Braiman **to direct the Executive Committee or the Chair to set the time and date of the next meeting of the State Committee to be held within two weeks** was seconded by Pietro Geraci and debated. A call of the question by Dustin Tait was seconded by Frederick Cole and passed 38-2. Mark Braiman’s motion failed 18-17, with 2 abstentions.

Motion by Frederick Cole **to adjourn** was seconded by Sean Phelan and passed without objection.

The organization meeting was adjourned at 11:51 a.m.

Andrew Martin Kolstee
Recording Secretary

Exhibit 1 (page 1 of 6)

Special Rules of Order of the Libertarian Party of New York for the Organization Meeting of September 26-27, 2020

As adopted by the State Committee on September 26, 2020.

Rule 1. **AGENDA.** The order of business shall be as follows:

- (a) The current Chair shall call the meeting to order.
- (b) The Chair shall call the roll to identify the elected State Committee members present.
- (c) The Chair shall serve as the Presiding Officer and Secretary shall serve as the Recording Secretary, respectively, of the Organization Meeting, unless they decline or are unable to serve, at which point a Temporary Chair and/or Temporary Secretary shall be elected for the duration of the meeting.
- (d) Report of Rules Subcommittee and adoption of the Special Rules of Order of the Organization Meeting.
- (e) Filling of vacancies on the State Committee.
- (f) Supplemental report of the Credentials Subcommittee.
- (g) Report of Rules Subcommittee and adoption of the Rules of the Libertarian Party.
- (h) Election of the officers and five Members-At-Large of the Executive Committee.
- (i) Discussion and consideration of Platform amendments.
- (f) Report of Resolutions Subcommittee.
- (g) Adjournment.

Rule 2. **CONVENTION COMMITTEE.**

Rule 2.1. The Interim State Committee shall appoint a special Convention Committee to plan and execute the Organization Meeting. The Convention Committee shall also appoint the following special subcommittees: Convention Arrangements Subcommittee, Program Subcommittee, Rules Subcommittee, Credentials Subcommittee, and Resolutions Subcommittee. The Convention Committee and each subcommittee may appoint assistants for the facilitation of their responsibilities. The Convention Committee and its subcommittees shall cease to exist upon the adjournment of the Organization Meeting.

Rule 2.2. The State Committee shall ratify the Convention Committee appointments.

Rule 3. **PRESIDING OFFICER.**

Rule 3.1. The Chair of the Libertarian Party, or if unable to fulfill his duties, the 1st Vice-Chair or subsequently, the 2nd Vice-Chair, shall be the presiding officer until a Temporary Chair is chosen by the members of the State Committee.

Rule 3.2. If the presiding Chair accepts a nomination for any office, the current 1st Vice-Chair or 2nd Vice-Chair shall preside over the election of that office.

Exhibit 1 (page 2 of 6)

Rule 4. **CREDENTIALS.** The Secretary of the Libertarian Party, acting as the Chair of the Credentials Subcommittee, directly after the opening ceremonies of the business meeting, shall call the roll of the elected members of the State Committee.

Rule 5. **IDENTIFICATION OF VOTING MEMBERS.** To facilitate identification, seating and voting, members and others shall be required to retain and display upon request the wristbands, voting cards, or other indicia issued by the Credentials Subcommittee upon registration. Division votes, whether simple or counted, shall be taken by members' standing and display of such voting member indicia. For meetings held by teleconference, voting members shall be identified within the platform or platforms used to conduct the meeting.

Rule 6. **DEBATE.**

Rules 6.1. No member shall speak in debate on the same question a second time until every other member who wishes to speak had the opportunity to do so.

Rule 6.2. No member shall speak in debate on the same question more than twice or longer than three (3) minutes in total without permission of the convention granted by a two-thirds vote without debate.

Rule 7. **FILLING OF VACANCIES.** Vacancies on the State Committee shall be done in a manner as described in this Rule and in accordance with the Party Rules.

Rule 7.1. Nominations for vacancies in the State Committee may be submitted by any member of the State Committee. If such nominations are received by the Credentials Subcommittee at least seven (7) days in advance of the organization meeting, the Credentials Subcommittee shall distribute the names of the nominees and any statement regarding their candidacy of no more than two hundred words to all members of the newly elected State Committee at least five (5) days in advance of the organization meeting. Once the filling of vacancies begins, the Credentials Subcommittee shall present the nominations they received and all such qualified candidates that accepted the nomination shall be entered into nomination. Subsequent nominations may be made on the floor of the Organization Meeting, prior to the election to fill such vacancies. The Chair shall request that each nominee confirm that they are qualified to fill the vacancy and accept the nomination in order to be entered into nomination to fill the vacancy they seek.

Rule 7.2. For each district, the ballot shall contain all the names of the eligible nominees and identify the number of vacancies in the district. Each ballot shall contain NOTA as a candidate.

Rule 7.3. The election shall be held with approval voting and candidates with the most votes shall be elected to fill the vacancy or vacancies as long as they have received a majority of the vote of the voting members. If there is a tie in which two or more candidates have received a majority of the vote of the voting members and at least one vacancy still exists, an instant run-off vote shall occur. If NOTA receives a majority of the votes, there will be a new round of nominations and a new election, in which all of the nominated candidates who were outpolled by NOTA are ineligible.

Exhibit 1 (page 3 of 6)

Rule 7.4. Members of the Libertarian Party chosen to fill vacancies on the State Committee shall not be allowed to participate in the meeting until acceptance by the State Committee of the subsequent report of the Credentials Subcommittee, scheduled to occur after the filling of vacancies; and in particular may not nominate, speak, or vote in any contested election for filling additional vacancies.

Rule 8. **ADOPTION AND AMENDMENT OF PARTY RULES.**

Rule 8.1. All proposed amendments of the Party Rules must be in writing submitted to the Rules Subcommittee at least seven (7) days in advance. The submission may include a rationale of up to 500 words. There shall be no debate on an amendment until the language has been proposed in writing and a copy thereof has been provided or displayed to all members of the State Committee.

Rule 8.2. Amendments that involve the modification of more than 10 words must be submitted in writing to the Rules Subcommittee at least seven (7) days in advance of the meeting. The Rules Subcommittee shall distribute the proposed amendments to all members of the State Committee.

Rule 8.3. Any discussion opposing the adoption of any Party Rules altogether shall be out of order.

Rule 8.4. Once the portion of the agenda pertaining to the adoption of Party Rules begins, the only discussion in order is amendments, and these must be taken up in the order that the Rules Subcommittee received them, except for the following:

Rule 8.4.1. The version of the Rules recommended by the Interim State Committee shall be the base set of Rules considered as the first motion during that portion of the agenda. All other motions pertaining to the adoption of the Party Rules shall be considered as amendments to that motion. No motion to divide this base set of Rules shall be in order.

Rule 8.4.2. If discussion on an amendment has begun, any recognized speaker may also discuss alternative proposed amendments that deal with the same issues and may use that text to propose a substitution to the current amendment.

Rule 8.4.3. If a member of the State Committee proposes more than one amendment, their subsequent proposals shall be taken up only after every other member's first proposed amendment has been considered.

Rule 8.4.4. The Rules Subcommittee shall have the authority to correct the numbering and references to article sections and paragraph numbers within the text.

Rule 8.5. Amendments that involve the modification of 10 words or fewer are allowed from the floor and must be submitted to the Rules Subcommittee in writing before consideration by the body.

Rule 8.6. Debate on each amendment shall be limited to ten (10) minutes. Each speaker is limited to one (1) minute at a time. The Chair shall alternately recognize those speakers in favor of and opposed to the amendment.

Exhibit 1 (page 4 of 6)

Rule 8.7. Once an amendment to the Rules has been proposed in writing and seconded, no motion to divide that amendment shall be in order.

Rule 8.8. After 12:15 p.m., no further amendments to the Rules will be considered. As soon as the current speaker's time is up, the question shall be called on any amendments then being considered.

Rule 8.9. At 12:30 p.m., all debate on the Rules shall cease, and the Chair shall proceed immediately to a roll-call vote on the full version of the Party Rules then before the State Committee. If the adoption of the proposed full version of the Party Rules fails, then the most recent version of the Party Rules as adopted by the Interim State Committee of the Libertarian Party shall be adopted unamended as the Party Rules by default.

Rule 9. ELECTIONS OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE.

Rule 9.1. GENERAL.

Rule 9.1.1. Nominations of all officers and Members-At-Large shall only be in order during the Organization Meeting in accordance with the agenda.

Rule 9.1.2. **ELECTIONS BY ELECTRONIC MEANS.** All elections of the Executive Committee shall be conducted as a secret ballot using an electronic system that batches the ballots of in-person and teleconferencing participants together.

Rule 9.1.3. **NONE OF THE ABOVE (“NOTA”) AS A CANDIDATE.** All elections shall have NOTA as an option. On all elections for the Executive Committee, the choice of None of the Above (“NOTA”) is automatically recognized as included and valid. If NOTA receives a majority of the votes, there will be a new round of nominations and a new election, in which all of the nominated candidates who were outpolled by NOTA are ineligible.

Rule 9.2. **ELECTION OF OFFICERS.** Officers shall be elected individually in the following order: Chair, 1st Vice-Chair, 2nd Vice-Chair, Secretary, and Treasurer. In order to be elected to an officer position, the candidate must receive a majority of votes cast. If an insufficient number of candidates receive a majority on any given ballot, then the candidate with the lowest number of votes shall be removed from the ballot; a tie for smallest number of votes shall require a new ballot.

Rule 9.3. ELECTION OF MEMBERS-AT-LARGE OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE.

Rule 9.3.1. Members-At-Large of the Executive Committee shall be elected by majority vote in a single election. There shall be no more than one Member-At-Large elected from a Judicial District. Only the candidate with the highest number of votes from a Judicial District shall be elected.

Rule 9.3.2. If fewer than five candidates receive a number of votes equal to or greater than a majority of the number of ballots cast, another round of voting shall immediately occur. For any Judicial District where a candidate was successfully elected, all remaining candidates in that Judicial District shall be

Exhibit 1 (page 5 of 6)

dropped. When no candidate receives a number of votes equal to or greater than a majority of the number of ballots cast, the candidate with the lowest number of votes of all the remaining candidates will be dropped.

Rule 9.3.3. Subsequently rounds of voting shall be conducted until five Members-At-Large of the Executive Committee have been elected by a number of votes equal to or greater than a majority of the number of ballots cast, in which each are from a different Judicial District.

Rule 10. CANDIDATE SPEECHES.

Rule 10.1. Candidates for Chair shall each be allowed five minutes to speak; candidates for all other Party offices shall each be allowed three (3) minutes to speak. Candidates to fill vacancies on the State Committee shall be allowed one minute to speak. Candidates may cede their time only to other members of the State Committee to speak on their behalf during their allotted time. Speeches will not be allowed for uncontested positions, in which candidates are only running against NOTA.

Rule 10.2. Candidates seeking endorsement for the highest public office shall each be allowed five minutes to speak; candidates seeking endorsement for all other public offices shall each be allowed three minutes to speak; candidates seeking endorsement for any public office shall also each be allowed one nominating speech and one seconding speech of one minute each.

Rule 11. **ENDORSEMENTS OF CANDIDATES.** Endorsements of candidates for public office shall be made in the same manner as elections for Party office, except that endorsements shall require a two-thirds (2/3) majority. Each office shall be filled with one election, even if that office has more than a single position to be filled. Each election shall consist of a series of ballots. In each ballot, voters may vote for as many candidates as there are positions for the office still open or "None of the Above". If None of the Above achieves a majority, a new election shall be held for the open positions still remaining and the candidates who were outpolled by None of the Above shall be ineligible; otherwise, those who achieve the requisite majority shall be recognized as elected, in order of their vote totals and in order of the length of term. The candidate receiving the fewest votes shall be eliminated from succeeding ballots. Ties shall be resolved by a separate ballot.

Rule 12. **PLATFORM.** When discussing the Platform, the previously adopted Platform shall be the base on which amendments, additions, or deletions shall be offered. Such changes to the Platform shall require a vote in accordance with the Rules of the Libertarian Party.

Rule 13. RESOLUTIONS.

Rule 13.1. A resolution offered by an individual member shall be submitted by the maker and the seconder – each of whom shall be a member of the State Committee – and shall be sent by email directly to the Resolutions Subcommittee and the desk of the Recording Secretary.

Exhibit 1 (page 6 of 6)

Rule 13.2. The Resolutions Subcommittee may convene during the main meeting to consider resolutions. Each member who offers a resolution shall be given an opportunity to explain it to the Resolutions Subcommittee if he so requests.

Rule 13.3. The Resolutions Subcommittee shall review all resolutions in the order they were submitted, and shall amend the text of each resolution to the satisfaction of the member that submitted the resolution, while satisfying formatting requirements, grammar, clarity, etc. The Resolutions Subcommittee shall present a report to the State Committee of all resolutions in the order they deem appropriate.

Rule 14. **PERMANENT RECORD.** All reports and other material for the permanent record or printed proceedings shall be typewritten and, immediately on presentation, shall be sent to the Recording Secretary in electronic form.

Rule 15. **ANNOUNCEMENTS.** Notices for announcement to the convention shall be in writing, signed by the person (or a proper representative of the persons) under whose authority the announcement is issued, and shall be sent to the desk of the Recording Secretary.

Rule 16. **SUSPENSION OF SPECIAL RULES OF ORDER.** These Special Rules of Order may only be suspended by a two-thirds (2/3) vote.